

**ORAL ARGUMENT NOT YET SCHEDULED**

---

No. 11-5316

---

IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS  
FOR THE DISTRICT OF COLUMBIA CIRCUIT

---

CONSERVATION FORCE, DALLAS SAFARI CLUB, HOUSTON SAFARI CLUB, AFRICAN SAFARI CLUB OF FLORIDA, INC., WILD SHEEP FOUNDATION, GRAND SLAM CLUB/OVIS, CONKLIN FOUNDATION, BARBARA LEE SACKMAN, ALAN SACKMAN, JERRY BRENNER, STEVE HORNADY, SARDAR NASEER A. TAREEN and THE SOCIETY FOR TORGHAR ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION (STEP),  
Plaintiffs-Appellants,

v.

KEN SALAZAR, in his official capacity as Secretary of the United States Department of the Interior; DANIEL ASHE, in his official capacity as Director of the United States Fish and Wildlife Service; and the UNITED STATES FISH & WILDLIFE SERVICE,  
Federal Defendants-Appellees

---

*De Novo* Review of Administrative ESA Permitting and Downlisting

---

**APPELLANTS' ADDENDUM OF STATUTES AND REGULATIONS  
RELIED UPON IN THEIR OPENING BRIEF**

---

JOHN J. JACKSON, III  
*Attorney for Appellants*  
3240 S. I-10 Service Rd. W., Suite 200  
Metairie, LA 70001-6911  
Phone: (504) 837-1233  
Fax: (504) 837-1145  
Email: jjw-no@att.net

**STATUTES AND REGULATIONS**

**TABLE OF CONTENTS**

5 U.S.C. §551(13).....	2
5 U.S.C. §704.....	2
5 U.S.C. § 706.....	3
16 U.S.C. § 1536.....	4
16 U.S.C. § 1537.....	5
16 U.S.C. § 1538.....	6
16 U.S.C. § 1539.....	8
16 U.S.C. § 1540.....	10
28 U.S.C. §1331.....	13
28 U.S.C. § 2401.....	14
28 U.S.C. § 2501.....	14
50 C.F.R. §13.21.....	15
50 C.F.R. §17.22.....	19
U.S. CONST. amend. V.....	23

**5 U.S.C. §551(13)**

Definitions

(13) "agency action" includes the whole or a part of an agency rule, order, license, sanction, relief, or the equivalent or denial thereof, or failure to act[.]

**5 U.S.C. §704**

## Actions reviewable

Agency action made reviewable by statute and final agency action for which there is no other adequate remedy in a court are subject to judicial review. A preliminary, procedural, or intermediate agency action or ruling not directly reviewable is subject to review on the review of the final agency action. Except as otherwise expressly required by statute, agency action otherwise final is final for the purposes of this section whether or not there has been presented or determined an application for a declaratory order, for any form of reconsideration, or, unless the agency otherwise requires by rule and provides that the action meanwhile is inoperative, for an appeal to superior agency authority.

## **5 U.S.C. § 706**

### Scope of review

To the extent necessary to decision and when presented, the reviewing court shall decide all relevant questions of law, interpret constitutional and statutory provisions, and determine the meaning or applicability of the terms of an agency action. The reviewing court shall--

- (1) compel agency action unlawfully withheld or unreasonably delayed; and
- (2) hold unlawful and set aside agency action, findings, and conclusions found to be--

(A) arbitrary, capricious, an abuse of discretion, or otherwise not in accordance with law;

(B) contrary to constitutional right, power, privilege, or immunity;

(C) in excess of statutory jurisdiction, authority, or limitations, or short of statutory right;

(D) without observance of procedure required by law;

(E) unsupported by substantial evidence in a case subject to sections 556 and 557 of this title or otherwise reviewed on the record of an agency hearing provided by statute; or

(F) unwarranted by the facts to the extent that the facts are subject to trial de novo by the reviewing court.

In making the foregoing determinations, the court shall review the whole record or those parts of it cited by a party, and due account shall be taken of the rule of prejudicial error.

## **16 U.S.C. § 1536**

### Interagency Cooperation

(a) Federal agency actions and consultations.

\* \* \*

(2) Each Federal agency shall, in consultation with and with the assistance of the Secretary, insure that any action authorized, funded, or carried out by such agency (hereinafter in this section referred to as an "agency action") is not likely to jeopardize the continued existence of any endangered species or threatened species or result in the destruction or adverse modification of habitat of such species which is determined by the Secretary, after consultation as appropriate with affected States, to be critical, unless such agency has been granted an exemption for such action by the Committee pursuant to subsection (h) of this section. In fulfilling the requirements of this paragraph each agency shall use the best scientific and commercial data available.

## **16 U.S.C. § 1537**

### International cooperation

\* \* \*

(b) Encouragement of foreign programs. In order to carry out further the provisions of this Act, the Secretary, through the Secretary of State, shall encourage--

(1) foreign countries to provide for the conservation of fish or wildlife and plants including endangered species and threatened species listed pursuant to section 4 of this Act;

(2) the entering into of bilateral or multilateral agreements with foreign countries to provide for such conservation; and

(3) foreign persons who directly or indirectly take fish or wildlife or plants in foreign countries or on the high seas for importation into the United States for commercial or other purposes to develop and carry out with such assistance as he may provide, conservation practices designed to enhance such fish or wildlife or plants and their habitat.

## **16 U.S.C. § 1538**

### Prohibited acts

(a) Generally.

(1) Except as provided in sections 6(g)(2) and 10 of this Act [16 USCS §§ 1535(g)(2), 1539], with respect to any endangered species of fish or wildlife listed pursuant to section 4 of this Act [16 USCS § 1533] it is unlawful for any person subject to the jurisdiction of the United States to--

(A) import any such species into, or export any such species from the United States;

(B) take any such species within the United States or the territorial sea of the United States;

(C) take any such species upon the high seas;

(D) possess, sell, deliver, carry, transport, or ship, by any means whatsoever, any such species taken in violation of subparagraphs (B) and (C);

(E) deliver, receive, carry, transport, or ship in interstate or foreign commerce, by any means whatsoever and in the course of a commercial activity, any such species;

(F) sell or offer for sale in interstate or foreign commerce any such species; or

(G) violate any regulation pertaining to such species or to any threatened species of fish or wildlife listed pursuant to section 4 of this Act [16 USCS § 1533] and promulgated by the Secretary pursuant to authority provided by this Act.

\* \* \*

(c) Violation of Convention.

(1) It is unlawful for any person subject to the jurisdiction of the United States to engage in any trade in any specimens contrary to the provisions of the Convention, or to possess any specimens traded contrary to the provisions of the Convention, including the definitions of terms in article I thereof.

(2) Any importation into the United States of fish or wildlife shall, if--

(A) such fish or wildlife is not an endangered species listed pursuant to section 4 of this Act [16 USCS § 1533] but is listed in Appendix II to the Convention,

(B) the taking and exportation of such fish or wildlife is not contrary to the provisions of the Convention and all other applicable requirements of the Convention have been satisfied,

(C) the applicable requirements of subsections (d), (e), and (f) of this section have been satisfied, and

(D) such importation is not made in the course of a commercial activity,

be presumed to be an importation not in violation of any provision of this Act or any regulation issued pursuant to this Act.

\* \* \*

(g) Violations. It is unlawful for any person subject to the jurisdiction of the United States to attempt to commit, solicit another to commit, or cause to be committed, any offense defined in this section.

**16 U.S.C. § 1539**



## Exceptions

### (a) Permits.

(1) The Secretary may permit, under such terms and conditions as he shall prescribe--

(A) any act otherwise prohibited by section 9 [16 USCS § 1538] for scientific purposes or to enhance the propagation or survival of the affected species, including, but not limited to, acts necessary for the establishment and maintenance of experimental populations pursuant to subsection (j); or

(B) any taking otherwise prohibited by section 9(a)(1)(B) [16 USCS § 1538(a)(1)(B)] if such taking is incidental to, and not the purpose of, the carrying out of an otherwise lawful activity.

\* \* \*

(c) Notice and review. The Secretary shall publish notice in the Federal Register of each application for an exemption or permit which is made under this section. Each notice shall invite the submission from interested parties, within thirty days after the date of the notice, [of] written data, views, or arguments with respect to the application; except that such thirty-day period may be waived by the Secretary in an emergency situation where the health or life of an endangered animal is threatened and no reasonable alternative is available to the applicant, but notice of any such waiver shall be published by the Secretary in the Federal Register within

ten days following the issuance of the exemption or permit. Information received by the Secretary as a part of any application shall be available to the public as a matter of public record at every stage of the proceeding.

(d) Permit and exemption policy. The Secretary may grant exceptions under subsections (a)(1)(A) and (b) of this section only if he finds and publishes his finding in the Federal Register that (1) such exceptions were applied for in good faith, (2) if granted and exercised will not operate to the disadvantage of such endangered species, and (3) will be consistent with the purposes and policy set forth in section 2 of this Act [16 USCS § 1531].

\* \* \*

(g) Burden of proof. In connection with any action alleging a violation of section 9 [16 USCS § 1538], any person claiming the benefit of any exemption or permit under this Act shall have the burden of proving that the exemption or permit is applicable, has been granted, and was valid and in force at the time of the alleged violation.

\* \* \*

## **16 U.S.C. § 1540**

### **Penalties and enforcement**

\* \* \*

(g) Citizen suits.

(1) Except as provided in paragraph (2) of this subsection any person may commence a civil suit on his own behalf--

(A) to enjoin any person, including the United States and any other governmental instrumentality or agency (to the extent permitted by the eleventh amendment to the Constitution), who is alleged to be in violation of any provision of this Act or regulation issued under the authority thereof; or

(B) to compel the Secretary to apply, pursuant to section 6(g)(2)(B)(ii) of this Act, the prohibitions set forth in or authorized pursuant to section 4(d) or section 9(a)(1)(B) of this Act with respect to the taking of any resident endangered species or threatened species within any State; or

(C) against the Secretary where there is alleged a failure of the Secretary to perform any act or duty under section 4 which is not discretionary with the Secretary.

The district courts shall have jurisdiction, without regard to the amount in controversy or the citizenship of the parties, to enforce any such provision or regulation, or to order the Secretary to perform such act or duty, as the case may be. In any civil suit commenced under subparagraph (B) the district court shall compel the Secretary to apply the prohibition sought if the court finds that the allegation that an emergency exists is supported by substantial evidence.

(2) (A) No action may be commenced under subparagraph (1)(A) of this section--

(i) prior to sixty days after written notice of the violation has been given to the Secretary, and to any alleged violator of any such provision or regulation;

(ii) if the Secretary has commenced action to impose a penalty pursuant to subsection (a) of this section; or

(iii) if the United States has commenced and is diligently prosecuting a criminal action in a court of the United States or a State to redress a violation of any such provision or regulation.

(B) No action may be commenced under subparagraph (1)(B) of this section-

(i) prior to sixty days after written notice has been given to the Secretary setting forth the reasons why an emergency is thought to exist with respect to an endangered species or a threatened species in the State concerned; or

(ii) if the Secretary has commenced and is diligently prosecuting action under section 6(g)(2)(B)(ii) of this Act to determine whether any such emergency exists.

(C) No action may be commenced under subparagraph (1)(C) of this section prior to sixty days after written notice has been given to the Secretary; except that such action may be brought immediately after such notification in the case of an

action under this section respecting an emergency posing a significant risk to the well-being of any species of fish or wildlife or plants.

(3) (A) Any suit under this subsection may be brought in the judicial district in which the violation occurs.

(B) In any such suit under this subsection in which the United States is not a party, the Attorney General, at the request of the Secretary, may intervene on behalf of the United States as a matter of right.

(4) The court, in issuing any final order in any suit brought pursuant to paragraph (1) of this subsection, may award costs of litigation (including reasonable attorney and expert witness fees) to any party, whenever the court determines such award is appropriate.

(5) The injunctive relief provided by this subsection shall not restrict any right which any person (or class of persons) may have under any statute or common law to seek enforcement of any standard or limitation or to seek any other relief (including relief against the Secretary or a State agency).

## **28 U.S.C. §1331**

Federal question

The district courts shall have original jurisdiction of all civil actions arising under the Constitution, laws, or treaties of the United States.

**28 U.S.C. § 2401**

Time for commencing action against United States

(a) Except as provided by chapter 71 of title 41, every civil action commenced against the United States shall be barred unless the complaint is filed within six years after the right of action first accrues. The action of any person under legal disability or beyond the seas at the time the claim accrues may be commenced within three years after the disability ceases.

(b) a tort claim against the United States shall be forever barred unless it is presented in writing to the appropriate Federal agency within two years after such claim accrues or unless action is begun within six months after the date of mailing, by certified or registered mail, of notice of final denial of the claim by the agency to which it was presented.

**28 U.S.C. § 2501**

Time for filing suit

Every claim of which the United States Court of Federal Claims has jurisdiction shall be barred unless the petition thereon is filed within six years after such claim first accrues.

Every claim under section 1497 of this title shall be barred unless the petition thereon is filed within two years after the termination of the river and harbor improvements operations on which the claim is based.

A petition on the claim of a person under legal disability or beyond the seas at the time the claim accrues may be filed within three years after the disability ceases.

A suit for the fees of an officer of the United States shall not be filed until his account for such fees has been finally acted upon, unless the General Accounting Office [Government Accountability Office] fails to act within six months after receiving the account.

## **50 C.F.R. §13.21**

Issuance of permits.

(a) No permit may be issued prior to the receipt of a written application therefor, unless a written variation from the requirements, as authorized by § 13.4, is inserted into the official file of the Bureau. An oral or written representation of an employee or agent of the United States Government, or an action of such

employee or agent, shall not be construed as a permit unless it meets the requirements of a permit as defined in 50 CFR 10.12.

(b) Upon receipt of a properly executed application for a permit, the Director shall issue the appropriate permit unless:

(1) The applicant has been assessed a civil penalty or convicted of any criminal provision of any statute or regulation relating to the activity for which the application is filed, if such assessment or conviction evidences a lack of responsibility.

(2) The applicant has failed to disclose material information required, or has made false statements as to any material fact, in connection with his application;

(3) The applicant has failed to demonstrate a valid justification for the permit and a showing of responsibility;

(4) The authorization requested potentially threatens a wildlife or plant population, or

(5) The Director finds through further inquiry or investigation, or otherwise, that the applicant is not qualified.

(c) Disqualifying factors. Any one of the following will disqualify a person from receiving permits issued under this Part.



(1) A conviction, or entry of a plea of guilty or nolo contendere, for a felony violation of the Lacey Act, the Migratory Bird Treaty Act, or the Bald and Golden Eagle Protection Act disqualifies any such person from receiving or exercising the privileges of a permit, unless such disqualification has been expressly waived by the Director in response to a written petition.

(2) The revocation of a permit for reasons found in § 13.28 (a)(1) or (a)(2) disqualifies any such person from receiving or exercising the privileges of a similar permit for a period of five years from the date of the final agency decision on such revocation.

(3) The failure to pay any required fees or assessed costs and penalties, whether or not reduced to judgement disqualifies such person from receiving or exercising the privileges of a permit as long as such moneys are owed to the United States. This requirement shall not apply to any civil penalty presently subject to administrative or judicial appeal; provided that the pendency of a collection action brought by the United States or its assignees shall not constitute an appeal within the meaning of this subsection.

(4) The failure to submit timely, accurate, or valid reports as required may disqualify such person from receiving or exercising the privileges of a permit as long as the deficiency exists.

(d) Use of supplemental information. The issuing officer, in making a determination under this subsection, may use any information available that is relevant to the issue. This may include any prior conviction, or entry of a plea of guilty or nolo contendere, or assessment of civil or criminal penalty for a violation of any Federal or State law or regulation governing the permitted activity. It may also include any prior permit revocations or suspensions, or any reports of State or local officials. The issuing officer shall consider all relevant facts or information available, and may make independent inquiry or investigation to verify information or substantiate qualifications asserted by the applicant.

(e)(1) Conditions of issuance and acceptance. Any permit automatically incorporates within its terms the conditions and requirements of subpart D of this part and of any part(s) or section(s) specifically authorizing or governing the activity for which the permit is issued, as well as any other conditions deemed appropriate and included on the face of the permit at the discretion of the Director.

(2) Any person accepting and holding a permit under this Subchapter B acknowledges the necessity for close regulation and monitoring of the

permitted activity by the Government. By accepting such permit, the permittee consents to and shall allow entry by agents or employees of the Service upon premises where the permitted activity is conducted at any reasonable hour. Service agents or employees may enter such premises to inspect the location; any books, records, or permits required to be kept by this Subchapter B; and any wildlife or plants kept under authority of the permit.

(f) Term of permit. Unless otherwise modified, a permit is valid during the period specified on the face of the permit. Such period shall include the effective date and the date of expiration.

(g) Denial. The issuing officer may deny a permit to any applicant who fails to meet the issuance criteria set forth in this section or in the part(s) or section(s) specifically governing the activity for which the permit is requested.

## **50 C.F.R. §17.22**

Permits for scientific purposes, enhancement of propagation or survival, or for incidental taking.

Upon receipt of a complete application, the Director may issue a permit authorizing any activity otherwise prohibited by § 17.21, in accordance with the

issuance criteria of this section, for scientific purposes, for enhancing the propagation or survival, or for the incidental taking of endangered wildlife. Such permits may authorize a single transaction, a series of transactions, or a number of activities over a specific period of time. (See § 17.32 for permits for threatened species.) The Director shall publish notice in the Federal Register of each application for a permit that is made under this section. Each notice shall invite the submission from interested parties, within 30 days after the date of the notice, of written data, views, or arguments with respect to the application. The 30-day period may be waived by the Director in an emergency situation where the life or health of an endangered animal is threatened and no reasonable alternative is available to the applicant. Notice of any such waiver shall be published in the Federal Register within 10 days following issuance of the permit.

(a)(1) Application requirements for permits for scientific purposes or for the enhancement of propagation or survival. A person wishing to get a permit for an activity prohibited by § 17.21 submits an application for activities under this paragraph. The Service provides Form 3-200 for the application to which all of the following must be attained:

(i) The common and scientific names of the species sought to be covered by the permit, as well as the number, age, and sex of such species, and the activity sought to be authorized (such as taking, exporting, selling in interstate commerce);

(ii) A statement as to whether, at the time of application, the wildlife sought to be covered by the permit (A) is still in the wild, (B) has already been removed from the wild, or (C) was born in captivity;

(iii) A resume of the applicant's attempts to obtain the wildlife sought to be covered by the permit in a manner which would not cause the death or removal from the wild of such wildlife;

(iv) If the wildlife sought to be covered by the permit has already been removed from the wild, the country and place where such removal occurred; if the wildlife sought to be covered by the permit was born in captivity, the country and place where such wildlife was born;

(v) A complete description and address of the institution or other facility where the wildlife sought to be covered by the permit will be used, displayed, or maintained;

(vi) If the applicant seeks to have live wildlife covered by the permit, a complete description, including photographs or diagrams, of the facilities to house and/or care for the wildlife and a resume of the experience of those person who will be caring for the wildlife;

(vii) A full statement of the reasons why the applicant is justified in obtaining a permit including the details of the activities sought to be authorized by the permit;

(viii) If the application is for the purpose of enhancement of propagation, a statement of the applicant's willingness to participate in a cooperative breeding program and to maintain or contribute data to a studbook;

(2) Issuance criteria. Upon receiving an application completed in accordance with paragraph (a)(1) of this section, the Director will decide whether or not a permit should be issued. In making this decision, the Director shall consider, in addition to the general criteria in § 13.21(b) of this subchapter, the following factors:

(i) Whether the purpose for which the permit is required is adequate to justify removing from the wild or otherwise changing the status of the wildlife sought to be covered by the permit;

(ii) The probable direct and indirect effect which issuing the permit would have on the wild populations of the wildlife sought to be covered by the permit;

(iii) Whether the permit, if issued, would in any way, directly or indirectly, conflict with any known program intended to enhance the survival probabilities of the population from which the wildlife sought to be covered by the permit was or would be removed;

(iv) Whether the purpose for which the permit is required would be likely to reduce the threat of extinction facing the species of wildlife sought to be covered by the permit;

(v) The opinions or views of scientists or other persons or organizations having expertise concerning the wildlife or other matters germane to the application; and

(vi) Whether the expertise, facilities, or other resources available to the applicant appear adequate to successfully accomplish the objectives stated in the application.

(3) Permit conditions. In addition to the general conditions set forth in part 13 of this subchapter, every permit issued under this paragraph shall be subject to the special condition that the escape of living wildlife covered by the permit shall be immediately reported to the Service office designated in the permit.

(4) Duration of permits. The duration of permits issued under this paragraph shall be designated on the face of the permit.

\*\*\*

#### **U.S. CONST. amend. V.**

Criminal actions--Provisions concerning--Due process of law and just compensation clauses.

No person shall be held to answer for a capital, or otherwise infamous crime, unless on a presentment or indictment of a Grand Jury, except in cases arising in the land or naval forces, or in the Militia, when in actual service in time of War or

public danger; nor shall any person be subject for the same offence to be twice put in jeopardy of life or limb; nor shall be compelled in any criminal case to be a witness against himself, nor be deprived of life, liberty, or property, without due process of law; nor shall private property be taken for public use, without just compensation.